The Bread and Puppet Theatre Company's use of puppetry methods to communicate a social critique about xenophobia in three of their plays.
Abstract

This extended essay explores the puppetry methods used by the Bread & Puppet Company and argues whether these techniques have contributed to communicating a powerful social critique about xenophobia in the United States, mainly in the context of the War on Terror. In order to do so, three of their performances were analyzed and contrasted: *The Battle of the Terrorists and the Horrorists* (2007), *The Divine Reality Comedy* (2008) and *All of Us: Unity and Fragmentation* (2009). As part of their sub-themes, all three of these plays explore the meanings of right-wing fundamentalism, consumerism and war. The very first step of the research was to gather information about general techniques used in puppetry as well as specifics about Bread & Puppet’s evolution in the theatre world, after which a more focused approach was taken to study the theatrical methods of the three plays. Valuable information was found via secondary research, particularly from theatre critiques, about the impact the plays have on the audience; however, most significant insights were driven from primary research such as participating in the workshops “Radical Puppetry” by Amy Christian from Wise Fool New Mexico and on giant puppetry by the Bread & Puppet alumnus Nathan Scott. The email interview with Bread & Puppet’s choreographer Maura Gahan also greatly contributed to the process of investigating the particular role of dance in puppetry. Being able to participate in the creation and performance of *All of Us* also enabled me to personally engage within the field of puppetry. I came to realize that the most powerful methods used to communicate a strong social critique are giant puppetry, the use of satirical propaganda and the absence of speech allowing freer interpretations, yet that more could be done in terms of making the plays meaningful to unaware audiences.

Word Count: 297
The Bread and Puppet Theatre Company’s use of puppetry methods to communicate a social critique about xenophobia in three of their plays

Table of Contents

Abstract .......................................................................................................................... 1
Table of Contents ......................................................................................................... ii
Acknowledgements ...................................................................................................... iii
Introduction .................................................................................................................. 1
Body Paragraphs .......................................................................................................... 3
  Gestures Are Louder than Words.............................................................................. 3
  When Capitalism Manipulates the Rods................................................................. 6
  The Symbol of Santa Claus..................................................................................... 6
  The War on Terror................................................................................................. 7
  The Integrated Arts................................................................................................. 8
  Music....................................................................................................................... 9
  Dance...................................................................................................................... 9
  Peter Schumann Extends the Concept of Puppetry........................................... 10
  Puppetry as Propaganda....................................................................................... 12
  Preaching Deafly and the Remedy of Street Theatre....................................... 12
  Controversial Propaganda.................................................................................... 14
Conclusion .................................................................................................................. 16
Bibliography .............................................................................................................. 18
Acknowledgements

First and foremost, I would like to thank my extended essay supervisor and theatre teacher Tim Crofton for his patience and support throughout this project. His advice encouraged me to explore the field of puppetry - one I was intrigued about yet less familiar with. My thanks also go to the librarian Janet Gerard who provided our school community with useful research tools and broadened my knowledge about reliable sources. It is also vital to mention that this essay would have been radically different without Nathan Scott’s presence. He taught me essential knowledge about Bread & Puppet and practical skills about giant puppet building, and without him the project All of Us: Unity and Fragmentation would never have been possible. I am also grateful to Gloria Chow for taking pictures during the show and sharing them with me. To Maura Gahan from Lubberland National Dance Company for dedicating some of her time to respond my questions about the role of dance and its effects in her productions. Last but not least, I’d like to thank Amy Christian whose workshops on puppetry and street theatre greatly refueled my interest for puppetry and gave me the enthusiasm to carry on with the last parts of this essay.
Introduction

Bread and Puppet is among the oldest self-sustaining, nonprofit and politically oriented theatre companies in the United States. Its German-born founder Peter Schumann studied dance and sculpture before he started practicing his art in his home country. However, soon after he realized that the rigor of the art world in the German fifties did not allow him to express his inner theories and views about his own artistic perspectives. As he said, “arts have come to fulfill a sort of elitist function.”¹ Thus in 1961 he decided to move to the United States where he quickly found what he was seeking: a more accepting and liberal art world where he felt comfortable enough to found his own theatre company two years later in New York: Bread and Puppet. Since then Bread and Puppet has clung to several political issues ranging from the Vietnam War in their debut to larger criticism about the whole Western society while spreading messages of peace, hope and the importance of tight community working for a more humane world. In two of the plays studied in this essay, The Divine Reality Comedy and The Battle of the Terrorists and the Horrorists, Peter Schumann and his puppeteers have once again tackled a controversial issue that is worth deeper examination: the causes for the War on Terror and its consequent xenophobia, which Peter Schumann attributes to a wrong direction in the modern American society: capitalism. The third piece analyzed in this essay is All of Us: Unity and Fragmentation, a play directed by the Bread & Puppet alumnus Nathan Scott in September 2009, created and produced by the theatre students

of the United World College – USA. In this particular play in which I had the honor to participate, Nathan Scott uses the Bread and Puppet methods to express nationalism and the fear for the other, which are derived from our capitalist alienation from the natural world. The play starts as a harmonious description of the world, yet as the different nations each represented by different giant puppets become aware of their differences they start fighting until Mother Nature intervenes, begging for the pointless destruction to cease. The Divine Reality Comedy is derived from Dante’s The Divine Comedy, although contextually very little has been kept from the original work except for similarities with the play’s segmented structure. Contrarily to Dante’s version which begins in hell and ends in paradise, Schumann staged the pageant to start in a “Paradise” where everything is seemingly well, and consumerism reigns, directly followed by “Post-Paradise” where white horses dance as a symbol for the End of Days;² the darker parts of the performance start with “Purgatory” which is a criticism of prisons and this leads us immediately to the last part “Inferno” where prisoners of Guantanamo Bay are being interrogated and tortured. The Battle of the Terrorists and the Horrorists starts by announcing the end of the world by showing a giant puppet representing the Mayan Popol Vuh mythology – discreetly yet with grand serious – and the real play starts with a “master of ceremonies” announcing that a conflict has started among two distinct groups of people – the terrorists and the horrorists – who seem to be different but in the end are almost similar beneath the surface. Both groups have ideologies, notions of good and evil, and religions to which they intend to stick. In the play two gods appear:  

---

² Biblical symbol where white horse symbolizes the increasing number of people who preach for a fake Messiah and unreal salvation towards the End of Days.
The Bread and Puppet Theatre Company’s use of puppetry methods to communicate a social critique about xenophobia in three of their plays

the God of Nothing and the God of Everything, acted by the same person (Peter Schumann) thus making them undistinguishable. This scene is followed by an exposition of the cardboard citizenry – witness to the situation and victim of the system. The situation quickly evolves to a disastrous war between the two factions; the end shows us the giant Popol Vuh puppet another time, this time speaking his words of warning to the world. These themes are explored, as always, through a variety of sharp puppet acts intermitted by several dances. This essay will examine how puppetry and its related methods work to express those political controversies of xenophobia and the fear of other with power, honesty and originality.

**Gestures Are Louder Than Words**

In many aspects, puppetry is fundamentally different from what one could call conventional theatre: it does not need words in order to communicate ideas. The focus of puppet-based theatre productions is on movement rather than language. As Peter Schumann explained this in his program notes in 1967: “Puppet theater is of action rather than dialogue. The action is reduced to the simplest dance-like and specialized gestures.”[^3] This can be seen most strikingly in *The Divine Reality Comedy* when, in the fourth part of the play – *Inferno* (Hell) – the closing act shows a giant papier-mâché puppet being tortured in Guantanamo by its repressors – normal men disguised in dark clothing covering their whole silhouette. After being tortured on a waterboard, we can almost feel the deep exhaustion of the puppet. At the same time, small papier-mâché

The Bread and Puppet Theatre Company’s use of puppetry methods to communicate a social critique about xenophobia in three of their plays

figures are being manipulated on a table. In a theatre review published on December 1, 2007 in The New York Times, the eminent dance critic Claudia La Rocco describes the scene: “The image of those little huddled figures, mute and helpless, hits you harder than all of the breathless cable news coverage in the world”. Also, during this whole scene the only spoken words that are pronounced by the narrator are from a poem written by an inmate from Guantanamo and an interrogation of one of the prisoners. But even so, the focus is mostly on the movement of the puppet and the way they reflect the power of the scene and the poems through their silent acting. The play ends with the dislocation of the tortured giant puppet – its body parts slowly detach and end in very small pieces all across the stage while only the sound of a hammer banging on the table can be heard. This shows the ultimate end of a society where important values about humanity and fundamental rights have been lost to benefit the policies of the nations in power. This example is clearly oriented to make people realize what truly happens in the society and the magnitude of the fundamental crimes against humanity committed in Guantanamo Bay because, as Schumann says “Puppetry…displays life in its clearest terms”\(^4\). Words are then most often not needed to effectively communicate a message.

In the Battle of the Terrorists and the Horrorists there is also a powerful scene when no words are used. Oppositely to The Divine Reality Comedy, this scene is the very first. It is actually an introduction to the whole show, a bitter note added by Peter Schumann to make the audience immediately understand that this play is not going to be a superficial farce. A giant rod-puppet is hung from the ceiling, waiting for the audience to get seated.

The Bread and Puppet Theatre Company’s use of puppetry methods to communicate a social critique about xenophobia in three of their plays

It is floating there with a smooth movement, the rods being slowly pulled to create a back-and-forth movement. The puppet is a representation of the Popol Vuh, the Mayan council book, which announces the end of the world. The trick of this scene lies in its surprise. It is rare for the Bread and Puppet Company to start a play with their productions with such a dark tone. The image of Popol Vuh is serves two purposes: tell the audience that it is not all going to be about happiness but also announce the main point of the play, which is to warn the Americans of the dangerous consequences that arbitrary discrimination might cause to their society. Again, no words are used; it is all about the muteness of the puppet – an immobilized figure lying above the world as a messenger of the future. It does not seem to belong to our world - it seems so stiff and immobile, as if it was sent straight from the past or some other dimension. With these two giant and mute puppets, Schumann attained his ideal of puppetry, which is “equipped with a skeptical itch against our normal over-employment of words” because “it actually seems to prefer the absence of speech over the engagement of speech.”

When capitalism manipulates the rods

The symbol of Santa Claus

One can wonder why money is a recurrent theme in the Bread and Puppet shows; indeed it is mentioned in every play either literally or allegorically. Even being aware of the clear left-wing orientation of the company cannot explain this trend fully. What we need to know is Peter Schumann’s contribution in that aspect. Schumann attributes many, if not all of the wrongs of the planet to capitalism, which is for him the primary cause to wars, inequality and has driven people away from a beneficial communal life. This led him to create a satirized figure of Santa Claus in The Divine Reality Comedy, who symbolizes the concept of money and unequal wealth. At the very beginning of the play, when we are still in the consumer’s “Paradise”, a tall man dressed in Santa Claus’ traditional bright red outfit performs a frenzy dance, performing pirouette after pirouette while the band is playing a lively music with trombones, bass drums, clarinets and accordions. Indeed, as we are still in Paradise, the heavy consumers, in other words the white American middle-class, are at their peak of rejoicing. To enhance his message, Schumann staged black and white cardboard skeletons moved by puppeteers to perform another frenetic dance. These skeletons communicate a strong statement, expressing that the focus on material goods such as those provided by the icon of a consumerist
lifestyle Santa Claus will end up depriving people from what is essential to them: life.

As Peter Schumann mentions in his interview with Greg Cook, an active journalist, photograph, poet and long-time friend of Bread and Puppet in February 2009, “I see the cruelty of this society is coming directly from the wonderful philosophy of capitalism, it’s directly related.”

*The War On Terror*

Nowadays Peter Schumann continues satirizing the American consumerism yet with a new perspective to it with the recent War on Terror and the injustices committed in the Middle East. In his interview with Greg Cook, he explained, “it’s the sad late stages of this form of capitalism that can’t possibly be longer with us. That will kill us for sure, it just doesn’t work.” Based on these statements, one can conclude that the prejudices the general public has about terrorists and immigrants in a larger context is largely based on a system based on selfishness, the protection of one’s own capital from “outsiders’ attacks”. This can be translated to a society-wide symptom in the United States, a form of internal capital protectionism. This is how Peter Schumann got inspired for his new plays, As “it just doesn’t work” Peter decided to rely on his puppets and faithful puppeteers, dancers and musicians to express his thoughts (see “The Integrated Arts.”)

---

The Bread and Puppet Theatre Company’s use of puppetry methods to communicate a social critique about xenophobia in three of their plays

In “Paradise”, Santa Claus performing his frantic dance while skeleton puppets dance in the background. (http://gregcookland.com/journal/2008/01/bread-and-puppet-theater.html)

The Integrated Arts

Puppetry, strongly influenced by folk traditions, has incorporated elements from both music and dance, so that they have come to make up an integral part of the performance, as the importance of words is oftentimes minimized. This can be seen in all three of the plays, which will be demonstrated through several examples.
Music

In The Divine Reality Comedy, the tone of the play is already set before the performance begins as the “Pleasure Society Brass Band” plays in the lobby when the audience is waiting. The live band continues to play throughout the play, creating a circus-like atmosphere that catches the attention, the tempo getting faster during the most crucial scenes, such as during the Santa Claus scene where the audience is first introduced to the criticism of society. In the same way, music played a very central role in All of Us as no speech was used. Stephen Hatfield, the sound designer, used one of his a cappella compositions in which he collaborated with Native Alaskans singers as the basis for the plot. When performed at the United World College, the school’s African Chorus performed the song. This was a deliberate effort to enhance the theme of tolerance and understanding between nations in a country where racial segregation has been a very defining trait of the recent history.

Dance

In order to understand more about the preponderant role of dance in puppetry, I had the opportunity to interview Maura Gahan, founder of the Lubberland National Dance Company and choreographer for Bread & Puppet, via email on October 19, 2009. When asked about her personal involvement in the puppetry company, she replied “Dance is the root of Bread and Puppet, which is why I tend to view all of our work as dance.”
Also, when asked about the role of dance within the plays, she answers that the question is invalid as it is the same as asking the way in which way did narration, acting or lighting influence it – it is too much of an essential element to be isolated from the rest of the play. When talking about The Divine Reality Comedy, she defines the choreographies as simple to emphasize the “group unison movements” which enhances the concept of unity in the American society “against the unknown.” Much space is also allowed to improvisation, an element that we incorporated in All of Us. The nations’ citizens did not have any planned choreography – they were encouraged to follow their impulses and express, as entities, the different emotions of anger, hatred and fear that represent their xenophobia and misunderstanding of the other.

**Peter Schumann extends the concept of puppetry**

With Peter Schumann, the idea of puppetry is far from being confined to the realms of two-dimensional, papier-mâché and cardboard creatures moved by humans. While those authentic puppets are the heart and soul of the company, Peter Schumann has found a way to transform humans into puppets in his performances, meaning that the performer then serves the purposes of the play and fades to communicate the idea he represents rather than acting out a personal version of it for glorification. This clearly adds to the theatre because it becomes more complex and allows new artistic experimentations. In All of Us, the main focus was on the five Humanity and Mother Nature giant puppets; the actors who were involved added insight to the story, not as individuals but as a larger collection of human-puppets. The actors were representatives of the four different nations presented in the show, symbolic entities reinforcing the message of nationalism.
and race, inflexible identity already introduced by the puppets. The actors had a similar role as the puppets; they did not have any lines and they were dressed up with their faces painted in the color of their nation. This is very much connected to Peter Schumann’s idea about the conformism of individuals in society; puppetry then becomes a tool to denounce conformity. For Schumann, each puppet, and each individual acting as a puppet has a life of its own: “when the puppet is manufactured it gets its own complicated face which should not be degraded to serve the purposes of character and story.” This leads us to define the actors involved in All of Us as puppet-characters. They each create a unique role in the play, which however does not give them any importance in terms of character or even story line. They are only one of the elements that contribute to communicate the message of racial prejudice, and destruction of peace and the natural world.

\[B\] Schumann, Peter, *A Fiddle Lecture* (1993)
The Bread and Puppet Theatre Company’s use of puppetry methods to communicate a social critique about xenophobia in three of their plays

The different nations are clearly separated and they express motions of hatred toward the others. (Picture by Gloria Chow)

**Puppetry as propaganda**

*Preaching Deafly and the Remedy of Street Theatre*

Bread and Puppet’s puppetry is a very engaged form of political theatre and many would even argue that activist puppetry and propaganda are indivisible concepts. This leads to the expression of strong political statements, such as anti-capitalism and the criticism of the War on Terror and its consequences. However in 1995, Leonard Lopate
challenged the concept of political theatre as art in his popular arts entertainment show “New York and Company” on WNYC Radio by asking Peter Schumann whether political theatre is explicitly propaganda and then whether propaganda is the opposite of art. Among his most interesting questions was the following: “Doesn’t political theatre preach to the converted and bore everyone else?” This leads us to the core of what is analyzed in this essay; Bread and Puppet unquestionably conveys strong messages in all three examined plays. Yet if they are able to communicate messages only to audiences already familiar with their values, an idea Leonard Lopate introduces in his show, the purpose of doing political theatre becomes somewhat useless since it does not raise awareness nor does it challenge people’s viewpoints. One of the ways puppetry remediates to this issue of solely “preaching to the converted” is by bringing theatre to the street. As Amy Christian from Wise Fool New Mexico explained in the workshops “Street Theater” and “Radical Puppetry” she held at the United World College-USA on January 18, 2010, “street theatre is fun, inviting and more easily understandable by the bystanders who happen to walk past the performance.” Street theatre is a way by which theatre can be made accessible to a larger audience. This triggers switches to the concept of theatre, as the plot needs to be fairly simple in order to maintain the attention of the audience, yet it also brings advantages as messages can be communicated to a
vast audience. Historically, Bread & Puppet has been involved in the production of several street performances and pageants; yet as the themes conveyed in two of the plays analyzed in this essay are very deep and serious, the options are more limited. By choosing to perform in indoor theatres, Bread & Puppet made the conscious decision of losing the advantage of entertaining the masses, yet gained the advantage of providing a meaningful experience to those interested in their conception of the issue of xenophobia and terrorism.

Controversial Propaganda

Although the criticism of capitalism and the role of propaganda seem to be harsher and occupy a more central place in The Divine Reality Comedy, there are still bits of puppetry acts that clearly refer to it in The Battle of the Terrorists and the Horrorists as well. This can be seen immediately in the first minute of the play when the giant puppet representing the Mayan Popol Vuh is lightened and revealed to the audience. No words are pronounced but one can read between the lines; the world is coming to an end because it cannot continue separating its people into categories and privileging and giving the power to only a minority of them (“The Horrorists”) while the others (“The Terrorists”) suffer under their control and are forced to act radically to make their voices heard. In another scene of The Battle of the Terrorists and the Horrorists, the meaning of propaganda expressed via the puppetry takes on another role that is at the same time thought provoking, daring and somewhat risky. In the scene “Ice Cold Reality” of the end of the play, a mixture of a dumbshow and puppetry, Peter Schumann
The Bread and Puppet Theatre Company’s use of puppetry methods to communicate a social critique about xenophobia in three of their plays presents a week of terror where citizens are being oppressed. In the surface, it seems as if this scene represents the “Ice Cold Reality” of citizens, both “terrorists” and “horrorists” in the United States where fear and repression have been prominent since 9/11. However, this scene – as always with theatre or any other kind of art – can be interpreted in many ways. Ian Thal, a talented mime and puppeteer working in Massachusetts broke up with Bread and Puppet after several years of successful collaboration and enriching projects because he interpreted the scene differently and saw a clear underlying meaning of this scene which he despised. According to him, the scene was not about the “Ice Cold Reality” of the United States but of Palestine and Israel. When the curtains open and the scene begins, grey puppet characters of women are shown with a closing cardboard wall around them while big black puppet boots are trampling them. The only issue for him is the following: that boot is the German jackboot, which has been associated with totalitarian systems of the 20th century, and most particularly with Nazism. Ian Thal saw a comparison in Peter Schumann’s message between the Jewish genocide and what is being done to the Palestinians by their Israeli neighbors. The propaganda went too far away in his opinion when, during the rehearsals the puppet-actors were directed to mime as if they were destroying the wall (separating Israel from the West Bank) and tearing it apart. The puppetry is organized in a very clever way, and there is no doubt that political statements are at the core of it. However, Peter Schumann blames these claims to be exaggerated. While he criticizes openly the Israeli government in an interview with Greg Cook (“There is no

The Bread and Puppet Theatre Company's use of puppetry methods to communicate a social critique about xenophobia in three of their plays

... ethical excuse for any of this violent dealings and revenging and so on. (...) But a state always takes exemptions from these ethics. So does the U.S. And so does Israel. It's a fascist democracy just like the U.S. is.”11, he denies the fact that he deliberately associated Nazi Germans with Israel. If misinterpreted, this passage speaks in favor of xenophobia, and against the tone that the play wanted to set. However, it is important to remember that while puppetry can express strong messages there is also much room for personal interpretation. Puppetry suggests ideas and concepts, evokes reflection yet cannot claim to express single universal truths accepted by everyone. The truths they express are often multiple. As Andrew Ryder, graduate student in Puppet History describes in an essay, the puppets “reach a kind of universality in their diversity of interpretation.” 12 It is up to the audience itself to determine the limits between art and pure propaganda, what is acceptable and what is not.

**Conclusion**

Bread & Puppet has truly taken advantage of its well-known and skilled puppetry to once again describe an issue of global importance with power: the War on Terror and its consequences on the American society, reinforcing the fear of the other, the fear of the...

---

11 Thal, Ian, *Excerpts from an interview between Greg Cook and Peter Schumann* (February 1, 2008) http://ianthal.blogspot.com/2008/02/notes-on-nejar-interview-with-peter.html
“terrorist” and widening differences based on race and culture. The methods used to achieve this powerful social critique are various, ranging from their loud political message to the simplicity of their choreographies, the thematic linkage to capitalism, to which every American can relate to and their trademark impressive giant puppets, only to cite the most significant ones. These puppets are an image of universal truths, and strong symbols, which everyone is invited to see with their own eyes to always create personal interpretations. In his flow of new shows criticizing the modern American society model, Peter Schumann has once again succeeded in creating clever and insightful puppetry to convince us of what he has always been assured of: a society mainly based on money and property can only lead to major misbalances on an international scale, as well as to dysfunctional social dynamics that enhance the gaps between the social classes. Perhaps Bread & Puppet’s audience is somewhat restricted to “the converted ones” - a group of hippies, activists, idealists and leftists; yet I believe that whoever takes the time to listen to their message will find something meaningful to relate to, as Schumann and his puppeteers always find a way to satirize the hopeless, mock the serious, amaze the blasé and delight the “Grumpy”. To end this essay I’d like to quote Maura Gahan commenting on the significance of The Divine Reality Comedy’s message from the interview she offered: “one can't calculate "effectiveness” but we can at least observe how many people stopped their lives to observe this show together, to experience these images, to hear the texts and music (...) We can witness the difference it makes for the volunteers and puppeteers who spend hours rehearsing together (...) I can't imagine another form of communication that is a direct, subversive, or creative as puppetry, especially when dealing with such heavy topics.”
The Bread and Puppet Theatre Company's use of puppetry methods to communicate a social critique about xenophobia in three of their plays.

Bibliography


